Conference Paper

The Changed City of Mecca: Understanding its Transition to Deep Globalisation

Author(s):
Barau, Aliyu

Publication Date:
2019-03

Permanent Link:
https://doi.org/10.3929/ethz-b-000339873

Rights / License:
Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International
The Changed City of Mecca: Understanding its Transition to Deep Globalisation

Aliyu Barau

Abstract

Pilgrimage to Mecca is an obligation for Muslims with ability to do so. Muslims also look at the Qibla (direction to Mecca) for their daily prayers (salat). The influence of Mecca is far and wide to the extent that many buildings in Muslim cities and towns are designed to align with the Qibla. The number of Muslims going to hajj has increased significantly and this makes Saudi authorities to undertake expansion of the Masjidil Haram – the Grand Mosque. However, such expansion projects and associated changes to the urban fabric of Mecca could not resist the forces of globalisation and modernisation trending in the Gulf region. The impacts of fast evolving modernisation, urbanisation and globalisation on small but culturally important Gulf cities such as Mecca is least investigated. This chapter analyses historical changes to the architecture and urban spaces in and around the city of Mecca. Pictures dated between 1880 and 2016 were used to identify patterns of modernisation and globalisation in Mecca. The changing morphology and architectural forms and concepts bereft Mecca of its many historic sites, decline in its all-encompassing spatio-spiritual appeal to pilgrims and possibly the emergence of spaces that most likely favour the richest and powerful. Thus, modernisation and globalisation are creating polarisation of the poor and the rich experiences in what supposes to be a landscape that exudes spirituality, equanimity and sense of sameness between races and sexes. The phenomenal expansions and renovations of Mecca’s Grand Mosque has in some ways undermined its standing as Ummul Qura (the Mother of all towns) in the sight of Muslims.
Introduction

Hajj, the practice of going to Mecca, Muslim’s holy land spans a wide range of social, economic, cultural, political, and sustainability dimensions which attract scholarly interests. For instance, some activists have used the concept of Hajjiology - a multidisciplinary and holistic approach for studying pilgrimage to Mecca and its impacts on landscapes, social, scientific, cultural, economic, and historical perspectives. Indeed, some scholars argued that Mecca and Madina are at the core of Muslim globalisation and they have some teleconnections with the two cities. Nevertheless, globalisation is a complex phenomenon that needs to be explored in the context of Mecca. Globalisation is seen as a forceful driver of landscape transformation in the ever-expanding urban areas. In particular, the most visible features of globalisation in urban areas of developing countries include postmodernist architecture, urban renewal programmes, recreational facilities and infrastructures for the rich and cosmopolitan urban. The story of Mecca is an interesting one as it closely links urbanisation with history, spirituality, environmental ethics, climatic uncertainty and globalisation. In the first place, it is important to ask if Mecca is a global city. The answer to this question is certainly contestable going by assumptions of western scholars such as Saskia Sassen whose emphasis is largely on the size of recent economics of transnational networks. In the case of modern globalisation, where flow of people, ideas, capital, products, pollution and crimes prevail one may as well assert that these features are common to Mecca now and in the past. The western-centric conceptualisations of globalisation are contestable because they neglect the roles and features of ancient cities particularly in respect of their size, culture, politics, and economic importance in relation to their surroundings. In this context, some scholars argued that cities such as Athens, Alexandria, Babylon, Carthage, and Rome are in their own rights ancient global cities. Following this argument, then one is free to ask why Mecca is not an ancient global city as well. Muslims all over the world seek for its direction (qibla) to pray while some Muslim cities orient their buildings to the direction of Mecca. The Hajj is itself a spiritual activity

---

depending on individual’s economic capacity and ability and therefore the long and arduous journey to Mecca from distant places around the world has its own economic, diplomatic and political imperatives. In what demonstrated the longstanding visibility of Hajj in the international geopolitics, it is reported that both governments of the Republic of China and Pro-Japanese government of Northern China sent their Muslim contingents to Hajj in 1930 in order to advance their international diplomatic interests.9 Going to Hajj in the 21st century has tremendously changed in many respects. For instance, in 2009 as many as 2.5 million pilgrims from 183 countries arrived in Mecca for Hajj.10 As a global phenomenal ass gathering issues relating poor food hygiene, outbreak of epidemics, accidents, waste management, security threats, exposure to heat are issues of great interest to urban sustainability and some level of global interest. In some cases, the Hajj rituals within and around Mecca provide some examples of issues of critical research interest to scholars of human environment relations around the world.11 Hajj serves as a melting point of cultures and the journey to Mecca has inherent cultural dimensions of globalisation which include foods and cuisine exchanges across cultures. Hajj is an event that holds on fixed days of Islamic lunar year and its celebrations extends to different countries and cultures. As example, people in Kyrgyzstan which is thousands of miles away from Mecca celebrate the Arafat day with different cuisines and activities.12 In relation to all these, this paper views Mecca as an ancient and contemporaneous space of Muslim globalisation which is being exposed and absorbed into the current universal and conventional view of globalisation which principally entails homogenisation of spaces, cultures, mass consumerism13 and architectural representations of urban spaces.14 Indeed, some Muslim scholars and activists have always considered Mecca as a platform for Muslim globalisation and or alternative to principles and ideals of western globalisation.15 The Hajj activity has changed in many respects that range from the widening sources of pilgrims, increasing number of pilgrims and expansion of Hajj infrastructure in Mecca and emerging sustainability risk of these changes.16 The main problem in the case of deepening globalisation is the apparent poor understanding and how these changes affect Mecca’s urban morphology. Some critics loathe expansion projects being undertaken at the holy city of Mecca where the nucleus of the expansion is centrifugal - moving or tending to move away from a centre – in this case the grand mosque. A number of critical Muslim

scholars express their anger over the speedy destruction of Mecca’s heritage sites in the name of mosque extension. Indeed, some critics estimated that about 400 cultural and historic sites were lost in the cause of making Mecca to have its own Big Ben and also to look like Las Vegas.

This paper explores the links and implications of intensifying globalisation and modernisation processes on Mecca’s urban landscapes. As far as documentation of narratives for this kind of study is concerned, literature review and old and recent pictures were found to be of good value for this paper. Similar studies have relied on images to explain Mecca’s connection with distant places. For example, Kruk and Oort studied how ex-pilgrims in Egypt adorned their homes with murals depicting Mecca. The authors used photographs of murals and building to present their analysis of nostalgic experiences of ex-pilgrims and how they communicate the centrality of Mecca to the Islamic world. This method is relevant for this study because some scholars noted that photographic narratives imply that writing history is universal spatial practice where boundaries are set between historical spaces – local and global. Another example is how photo-historians used pictures of Paris in 1950s and 1960s to understand historical and cultural contexts of how people lived there.

In this paper, globalisation is defined as those processes, practices, ideas, perceptions, and consumption patterns that have transformed Mecca from an exclusive Muslim and Islamic sacred urban landscape into one that is entangled, attached and open to influences of knowledge, arts, and technologies from beyond Arab and Islamic countries and regions. Mecca’s new outreach and exposure to wider world challenges it position as global Islam epicentre as evident in its changing built environment composition, functions and consumption behaviours of pilgrims and their practices of worship but eventually also on the practice of worshipping and conduct of pilgrimage. This definition re-echoes a view by some scholars who suggested that Mecca is “a cosmopolitan city and nodal point of global interactions far exceeding religious activities only.” This development creates sustainability challenges that are beyond the capacity of the city to absorb or dispense appropriately. For instance, during pilgrimage days, worshippers generate an average of 30,000 tons of food waste per day, 2.5 million boxes of water bottles, and equivalent of 5.6 tons of methane and 141,000 tons of carbon dioxide.

23 Mohamed Abdel Raouf and Hadeel Banjar, Greening the Haj: environmental challenges and sustainability options (Cambridge: Gulf Research Centre, 2017)
The Changed City of Mecca: Understanding its Transition to Deep Globalisation

Geography and History of Mecca and its Sacred Sites

For description of Mecca’s geography and history, this paper draws some of its points from Architectural Heritage of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. According to this work, Mecca lies in a lowland area that is roughly 300 m above sea-level. The city Mecca is situated between Sarwat and Tihama volcanic mountains that are criss-crossed by dry and thorny valleys. Mecca’s urban landscape features significantly shaped its history, urbanisation and spiritual activities. For instance, Jabal Alnour (Mount of Light) is where Hira cave is located and it is widely believed that it is the spot where Prophet Muhammad received pioneer revelation. Others mountains include Jabal Thor (Mount Thor) whose peak is 759 m and it is a popular spot in Islamic history as it is known as the spot of refuge for the Prophet when he was migrating to Medina. Abu Qubeis is another important mountain in Mecca rising some 272 meters east of the Grand Mosque and its other range raises to 420 meters near Bilal mosque. Also important is the Ajyad Fortress Mount whose peak reaches 406 meters and is overlooking the Grand Mosque from the North. To the West of the Mosque is another peak called Jabal Omar (Mount Omar) and this rises up to 280 meters. In the south-west direction of the Mosque lies Jabal Ka’aba which rise to 240 meters. Mount Qaiqa’an and its associated steeps such as Jabal Hind (Mount Hind) rise above the eastern, western and southern sides of the Mosque. Mount Arafat which over the plains where the most important Hajj ritual of mass gathering of pilgrims takes place located 18 km away from the Grand Mosque. One of the most important sites of pilgrimage is the Mina valley which covers roughly 6 km2; it is located seven kilometres away from Mecca. This stony valley is connected to another valley called Wadi Al-Nari (Fire valley) in Muzdalifa area in the outskirts of Mecca. These landscapes constitute both the city of Mecca and allied sacred sites at its edges shown in Figure 1.

According to Islamic traditions, the nucleus of Mecca city is the sacred Kaaba which is designated as the first house erected for humankind. The original name of Mecca is Bakka as mentioned in the Quran where it is narrated that Abraham and Ishmael were the people who constructed this house of God. Our source maintains that, since the early days of Islamic state there has been some documentation of the history. It is recorded that Omar bin Khattab (the second caliph) was the first Muslim leader to rebuild Ka’aba following flooding event called Um Nhishl in the 17th year after Hijra (Islamic lunar calendar (638 AC). Caliph Omar bought more houses around Kaaba and constructed a dam near the grand mosque to retain flood waters. Similarly, due to the increasing influx of more pilgrims into Mecca, in the 26th Hijra year (647 AC), the third caliph Othman bin Affan, acquired more land through buying adjacent homes which he converted into chambers of the sacred mosque.

---

25 Op cit
Again, in the 65th Hijra year (684 AC) Caliph Abdullah bin Al-Zubayr expanded the grand mosque following fire incidence in Mecca and this was the first time marble columns were used. In the 75 Hijri (694 AC), Caliph Abdulmalik bin Marwan constructed roof for the Grand mosque and decorated its column with gold slots. In the 91st Hijri year (710 AC), Al Waleed bin Abdulmalik demolished the works of his father and undertook a major reconstruction of the grand mosque. He undertook the first major architectural revolution through major expansion of the boundaries of the Grand Mosque. He imported columns and marbles from Egypt and Syria. He introduced green and white tiles inside the Kaaba and constructed shaded pavilions and decorated the mosque with mosaic tiles and calligraphy.

Between 160-164 Hijri years (777-781 AC), an Abbasid Caliph Al Mahdi expanded eastern and northern parts of the Grand Mosque and the purpose of this expansion project was to make Kaaba to be at the centre of the mosque. This expansion removed the flood infrastructure developed around the mosque. Al Mahdi’s architecture almost remained intact for 600 years. All these expansion programmes have some direct impacts on the urban fabric of Mecca.

Another major renewal was witnessed under Sultan Selim in 979 Hijri (1571 AC) and the major changes include reconstruction of corridors and domes. Another major reconstruction was witnessed under King Abdul Aziz in 1375 Hijri (1955 AC) and these renovation works were continued by his son King Khaled bin Abdul Aziz. These works included construction of two level corridors, renovation of walls with local marble and construction of seven minerals, and covering for Safa and Marwa –historic hills that are part of the Hajj rituals. In 1409 Hijri (1988), King Fahd bin Abdul Aziz contributed towards another milestone change to the architecture of the Grand Mosque by adding 257,000 m2 to accommodate 140,000 additional worshippers. He also added two minarets rising to some 89 meters and also added a new main gate and 14 ordinary ones. Around 2011, King Abdallah bin Abdul Aziz also initiated new ambitious extension and renovations of the grand mosque and this was continued by King Salam bin Abdul Aziz. The renovation and extension by King Abdallah is not restricted to the mosque. A railway was introduced to Mina and the Muzdalifa valleys to facilitate movement of pilgrims during Hajj days.

One of the prominent changes under King Abdalla is the major verticalisation of Mecca’s built landscape through construction of the World’s tallest clock tower. The giant tower is overlooking the Grand Mosque, Kaaba and the city of Mecca. This single project puts Mecca in the list of cities with tallest human created formations. Indeed, this development denotes the deepening of globalisation that this chapter subscribes to. Instead of the minarets of the Grand Mosque that used to be conspicuous and visible from all directions, Zam Zam towers is now the most visible feature in Mecca. Similarly, King Abdallah project includes installation of more plaza and expansion of tawaf – circumambulation area. One of the innovations is the installation of the world’s largest air-conditioned umbrella which is to cover the introduced benches for worshippers.26

Features of Sustainable Land Use in Mecca

Since the earliest centuries of Islam, the Hijaz region has been exposed to influences from outside the region while Mecca in particular has been a focal point of the Muslim pilgrimage. Although there are too few studies on patterns, process, and responses to political and economic globalisation by the city Mecca, scholars have exhibited a unison view that pilgrimage, the main activity associated with Mecca makes it “a cosmopolitan city and nodal point of global interactions far exceeding religious activities only.” As far back as 12th century artists made drawings of Kaaba on paper stones, ceramics which were displaced on religious spaces and this had enriched public awareness as well as attractiveness of Mecca and hajj among Muslims in Islamic world. For more on the nature of sacred dimension of land use in and around Mecca see Table 1. Muslim ummah is diverse in many respects and the holy cities of Mecca and Madina have remained the unifying forces of Muslim/Islamic sub-globalisation. As an indication of this old globalisation, as far back as 14th and 15th centuries, the renovation of sacred sites in Mecca attracted the attention and interest of rulers and scholars in Arabia, Turkey and Gujurat (Western India). This implies that cities, towns, villages – and their peoples – in Islamic societies constitute the peripheries of Mecca. As such, the holy city exerts cultural and spiritual influence over the Muslim states.

At one point or another, individuals and groups have directed their searchlights in exploring how best humans would respond to the increasing of ecosystems, heritage spaces, and sustainable lifestyles. In the western world, we have seen several alternative thoughts in the 20th century works of Aldo Leopold on land ethics, Naess worked on deep ecology, Lovelock on Gaia, a sense of place, and bioregionalism, Tuan on topophilia - love of land, biophilia or love of living things. For cities in particular, the work of Ebenezer Howard in 1902 is one of the foremost works that aim at engendering green cities. Thus, environmental ethics is enmeshed spirituality and traditional ecological and indigenous knowledge are some of the alternative ways that concerned individuals and groups used in responding to the growing ecological crises. Interestingly, several religious, cultural and ethnic traditions are being explored to complement contemporary policy and institutional measures for tackling environmental challenges. For most cities and their surrounding areas, Western scholars have studied them based on theories and models of land use systems that are

31 Burak, “Mecca, Its Description and Sovereignty in the Sixteenth-Century Indian Ocean: Jar Allah Ibn Fahd and His The Best of Joy of the Time for the Construction of Mecca by the Kings of the Ottoman Dynasty,” Lecture notes prepared for a presentation, Prince Alwaleed bin Talal Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding, School of Foreign Service, Georgetown University, 2016.
closely linked to economy and economics of land use. It is important to look at the principles of land use according to Islamic traditions and in particular in relation to land use and sustainability in Mecca. In contrast to the Western land use models, Islamic traditions have some basic rules of applications that target individuals and communities of land users. Models and principles of land use that guide sustainable planning and use of natural resource within and around cities, peri urban areas and villages and the most common guiding principles are hima and harim. Hima refers to reserve lands for growing and conserving trees and grassland, hima is a good for regulating land use and land carrying capacity. Harim is used for creating buffer zones around wells, city walls, watersheds, rivers, streams and other in urban and rural areas. Sustainable urban land use planning and management in Islam starts at the dawn of Islamic state. Once, Prophet Muhammad migrated to Yathrib he changed its toponym to Madinah Al-munawwara (an Illuminated city) and declared it as his haram (inviolable land). The haram of Madinah lies between its two volcanic hills, and between Gayr to Thawr. Prophet Muhammad also decreed against removing plants or hunting games between Gayr to Thawr. He is also reported to have invoked the curse of Allah, angels and entire human beings on any person that introduced vicious innovations into Madinah. Ibn Khaldun (1332-1406) in his Muqaddimah (1978) identified nine (9) requirements for the urban land use planning in Muslim societies. These are: a) town walls b) strategic location, c) consideration for prevention of air pollution, d) consideration for prevention of water pollution and infections, e) availability of water for the public, f) pasture ground for domestic animals, g) lands for urban agriculture, h) woodlands for energy and construction, i) accessibility and connectivity for external trade. Many scholars are impressed by the generative processes associated with most Islamic cities for being socially inclusive; for their agreed-upon ethical meta-principles; for being originated from locality’s history and customs; and for their appreciation of individual and collective rights and responsibilities. Such features tend to make such settlements to look natural and sustainable. In contrast to the organic form of Muslim cities, one of the leading Muslim urban scholar Besim Hakim criticised the western city models trademarked by ‘master plans’ for being static blueprints leading to formation of fabricated structures in cities.
Al-Faruqi and Al-Faruqi⁴⁰ observed that Islamic city is a negotiated habitat; its bazaar is not isolated from shops, banks, warehouses, caravansaries, apartments, mosques, gardens, and schools. Therefore, land uses interpenetrate each other in the Muslim urban spaces. These scholars gave example of Qurtubah (Cordoba) in Spain as model of an Islamic city which around 950 CE, Cordoba had population of 600,000 and its universities, public baths, libraries, shops, cemeteries and public gardens all spread across the walled city. Cordoba was a plural society with conspicuous presence of people from various social backgrounds. It is obvious that Islamic principles of land use have inherent sustainability values that support effective and inclusive urban planning and protection of large and small infrastructure. It is widely assumed that western principles and theories of land use put strong emphasis on spatial hierarchies and arrangements that traverse rural, semi-urban and urban areas. To begin with Makkah, which is considered as mother of all towns (Ummul-Qura) in the Muslim world: this position is associated with its space specific positioning in the Muslim world and use of its urban spaces for Hajj rituals. Following Abu-Khalil’s Atlas on the Prophet⁴¹, some works⁴² outline the details of spatial hierarchies and units for the Hajj rituals are grouped into four:

**Mawaqit (miqat, singular)**

These are places where pilgrims are requested to wear their ihram (white garb) for hajj or umrah. The five mawaqit used by people from various cardinal directions and bearings are stationed at varied distances from Makkah which range from 90 to 400 km. The five mawaqit are: Qarnal Manazil, Zat-Irq, Yalamlam, Juhfah, and Zul-Hulaifa. Pilgrims from every country are expected to use the miqat that is most appropriate to the direction of their country of origin. The farthest miqat away from Makkah is Zul-Hulaifa (410 km), and closest miqat to Makkah is Qarnal-manazil (80km). The next value ring is the Haram whose closest boundary to the holy mosque is 7.5 km and farthest are 22 km each. The Haram covers an area of 550 square kilometres. Some details on various land uses are given in Table 1 in the appendix.

**Haram**

Radius is the sacred and inviolable zone where it is forbidden to fell a tree, kill or poach an animal or shed human blood or engage in fighting and filthy actions. This radius covers an area of 550 square kilometres, and it encircles Masjidal Haram (the holy mosque). The closest range of this zone is 7.5 km at At-Tan’im, the medium is 13 km at Nakhlah, and the three farthest borders of Haram (inviolable zone) are all 22 km respectively.

---

Masjidil Haram

Masjidil Haram is the global central mosque which encircles the Ka’abah and within this mosque other sacred symbols can be found. The mosque does not have a defined border as is understandable from the various expansion projects carried out across history. The expansion of the grand mosque is the key determinant of transformations of landscapes in Mecca.

The Ka’abah

This is a black and golden calligraphy studded square house stands as Muslims central spiritual point and is considered as the holiest spot on earth. Muslims from all places on the four corners of the world ought to face Qiblah, a direction to the Ka’abah from any place on the Earth. The square house has a height of 14 m, and average side length of 11 m. Ka’aba is also attached to a raised curve called Hijri Ismail which is believed to be part of its original building. Pilgrims circumambulate the Kaaba while inside the grand mosque. On the other hand, Muslims all over the world look towards its direction – East, West, South, and North depending on their location on the planet.

Mecca draws pilgrims from different social, political, cultural and geographical backgrounds into its fragile landscapes. In order to stem and checkmate minimum damages to its ecosystems there are strict regulations that pilgrims and settled people must observe at all times. Prohibition of hunting and de-vegetation enhances conservation of the biodiversity especially in a hyper-arid zone like Makkah. Almawardi\textsuperscript{43} outlined the punitive measures put in place by Sharia against violators of the sanctity of the Haram. For instance, if any person cuts a tree he or she is expected by Islamic law to expiate it with a cow, and goat is for expiation when a pilgrim cut a tree in Mecca. In that regard Qur’an says: But forbidden for you is the pursuit of land-game; as long as you are in the sacred precincts or in pilgrim garb (5:96).\textsuperscript{44} This seems to be a good measure of sanctioning pilgrims which directly translate into conservation of the areas slim biodiversity. The measure also has great potentials for enhancing security and peaceful co-existence between pilgrims and Mecca’s local populace. Indeed, this clearly shows that Mecca’s inherent rules as enshrined in Islamic texts outline how the rules of living in the sacred land which directly or indirectly support social and ecological aspects of fostering sustainability.


\textsuperscript{44} Quran 5:96- Lawful to you is game from the sea and its food as provision for you and the travelers, but forbidden to you is game from the land as long as you are in the state of ihram. And fear Allah to whom you will be gathered. (Sahih International)
Land Use Change around Mecca’s Sacred Sites within the realm of global entanglement

In analysing selected historical pictures of Mecca (see figure 2), the author focused on observing lived environment features from the pictures in order to point out aspects relating to architecture and morphology that relate to globalisation and sustainability as well as the relationship between the city Mecca and processes of renovation and expansion of the Grand Mosque over time. Out of more than 50 old and new pictures, the author selected only 12 pictures. The pictures were selected based on the need to avoid repetition of elements, adequacy of representation of elements, and relevance to research goals. Unfortunately, due to lack of copyrights for the selected pictures the pictures can be published in this chapter. However, readers can catch glimpse of the pictures at the following web link: https://www.pinterest.com/fatimaenam9/old-pics-of-makkah-and-madina/?lp=true/. Thus most pictures contained some aspects of mountain landscape change, land use verticalisation, spaces for biodiversity, effects on natural and historic sites, and changes in architectural design and forms.

Loss of Mountain Settlements

Naturally, the Grand Mosque and Kaaba as well as other associated sites within and around the holy city of Mecca are fixed spaces for the ritual of Hajj. Hence, this creates permanent spatial values for these sites. Due to development of the aviation industry in 20th century, the number of pilgrims from all over the world is responsible for the massive influx of pilgrims from all over the world including Muslim minority countries in Europe, America and Far East. The increasing number of pilgrims necessitated the need for expansion. In order to create more space for the increasing number of worshippers in Saudi, the high density mountain settlements (see picture 1 and 7 as examples) around the Grand Mosque were demolished. Hence, the mosque expansion has always come at the cost of reducing the size of Mecca’s mountain slope settlements. As such, Mecca mountain settlement morphology is being lost to the expansion and modernisation of the Grand Mosque. The importance of mountain settlement in the earliest history of Mecca has been mentioned earlier in this chapter. The types of architectural structures and concepts replacing them are of western origin.

New Verticalisation in Mecca

On the other hand, verticalisation has been a feature of Mecca where high-rise buildings that accommodate the pilgrims surround the grand mosque (see pictures 3, 4, 7, 10). In contrast to old verticalisation, the new verticalisation that emerges with the 20th and 21st century expansion projects, the architects, engineers and building designers were mostly
western educated individuals with taste of western architecture (see picture 9, 10, 11). In other words, expansion projects ignored the traditional local Arab-Muslim architecture. It is important to stress that for centuries there has been an element of cultural globalisation in the renovation activities and the built style patterns for the Grand Mosque in Mecca. For instance, Mimar Sinan was the architect who led the renovation of the Grand mosque in the 16th century under the Ottoman Empire. In what shows the manifest influence of intensifying globalisation, one of the consultant designers of the recent renovations is a London’s Royal College of Arts Graduate namely, Jay Bonner. Now this could be seen as typical example of deep globalisation through cultural hybridisation whereby a non-Muslim played a crucial in designing the Grand Mosque. In contrast to Turkish-Arab verticalised architecture, the modern high-rise buildings have blocked the clear chances for mountain slope dwellers to have bird’s eye view of the Grand Mosque from their home or pilgrims accommodations.

**Modern Iconic Architecture vs. Mud Buildings**

Pictures 6 and 7 are examples of traditional architecture of Mecca before the recent changes. The old buildings were built using mud and stones. This contrasts sharply with glass, cement, marble and metal materials of the modern iconic structures of which most are imported. Modern iconic structure entails generally massive energy consumption at its inception and when put to use after completion. For instance, the foundations of modern building involve drilling of rock in the subsurface of the earth. The verticalised architectures also entail massive consumption of electricity for central air conditioning and people and loads lifting. Looking at picture 1, 2, 3 and 4, it is clear that before the recent modernisation, there existed a mutual co-existence between people’s residences, pilgrims’ accommodation and the Grand Mosque. This can be seen from the narrow roads or street bazaars separating the mosque and such buildings. In contrast, the recent expansion projects tend to separate the mosque and individuals’ buildings.

**Destruction of Historic and Natural Sites**

The expansion of Grand Mosque is responsible for destruction of Mecca’s cultural and natural landscapes and their associated social, spiritual and ecological benefits. For instance, Safa and Marwa hills have been enclosed and glossed and lost their natural forms. Jabal Omar (Mount Umar) has been demolished and replaced by high-rise 5 star hotel buildings. According to Sami Angawi in his interview with Aljazeera described how expansion projects ruined Mecca’s heritage. For instance, he nostalgically recalled their neighbourhood of

---

The Changed City of Mecca: Understanding its Transition to Deep Globalisation

Shaab Ali, a place where Prophet Muhammad lived. Few decades ago, the neighbourhood was bustling and busy were its narrow street – its night market and alleyways “smelled of rich incense and spices.” The Saudis expansion project for the Grand Mosque caused these areas to disappear completely. Other important monuments which were lost to expansion project include the House of Sayyida Khadija [the first wife of the Prophet Muhammad], and traces of buildings that had existed before the 8th century Abbasid era. Angawi also added that changes in architecture also came with the loss of traditional livelihoods of the local people who take pride in being custodians of pilgrims and the Grand Mosque.

Inequality in Access to Spaces around Sacred Sites

Picture 6 reveals that in the 1950s, the spaces for Hajj rituals were not exclusively used for such rituals. Small enterprises existed side by side with rituals. This has changed and stopped under the iconic structures and hotels. The new hotels around the Grand Mosque are the most expensive in Mecca and they have shopping malls selling branded items that only rich people can afford. These shops do not sell products found in bazaars. Based on these characteristics, it is difficult for the poorer pilgrims to get access to these spaces which have closest proximity to the Grand Mosque. In other words, accessibility to the mosque’s inner section is now possible only from Zam Zam towers - an iconic and high-end hotel.

New Mecca and Fast Food Consumerism Culture

One of the indicators of globalisation relates to the culture of consumption of fast foods. In the case of Mecca, Picture 5 and 6 show an aspect of globalisation of consumerism of Western products and goods in Mecca in the 1950s as evident in Coca Cola consumption and billboard (in Arabic). Today, avalanches of fast foods outlets of different franchise are found all over the city of Mecca. For example, McDonald’s outlets are located at Makkah Mall, Aziziah Street, Khmasin Street, Al Rasifah Street, and Awali Ibrahim Jaffali Street. On the other hand, the Kentucky Fried Chicken (KFC) has outlets just opposite the Grand Mosque in Zam Zam towers just like Pizza Hut and Burger King. The proliferation of fast food outlets in Mecca is another clear indication of how globalisation deepens through a homogenised global consumption seen in this ancient Muslim city. Clinically speaking, fast foods are considered as health threatening especially for those people who consume them consistently. Fast foods have high ecological footprints because most of their ingredients are being important from distant places.

Discussion and Conclusion

It is crucial to restate the purpose of the study which is to uncover the extent to which globalisation intensifies in Mecca’s urban landscapes and implications of this development.
In general, defining and redefining Mecca’s urban space in recent years is central to this paper’s discussion and conclusion. Mecca remains a low-density population whose highest density concentrates along the Grand Mosque. For any visitor to the Holy City, it is obvious that the high density is largely constituted by the population of pilgrims which varies with time. Hence, changes to Mecca’s urban space is critical to understanding the influences of globalisation and its implications to sustainability of this sacred city and its landscapes. In the context of this paper, sustainability entails the ability to maintain continuous co-existence of people and the sacred landscapes without jeopardising their quantity, quality, integrity and utilities. Thus, sustainability of this city and its sacred and way and manner worshipping is performed should be able to exhibit some level resilience to overwhelming globalisation. Here, resilience refers to ability of the city to represent its traditions and history even as it embraces opportunities offered by social, cultural and economic globalisation.

The history of Mecca shows that renovations of the Grand Mosque started in the 7th century AC. It appears that consensus among people defined the spatial use in Mecca. Perhaps, that is why it is discernible from pictures that people’s homes and enterprises were located within the vicinity of the Grand Mosque. Again, over the years politics and power have always defined spatial use and control of the Grand Mosque as evidenced in power changing hands between Meccans, Abbasids, Turks, Egyptians and House of Saud. The power changes have implications on the architectural forms and concepts used in building and renovating the Grand Mosque and city of Mecca as a whole. Consensus building is fundamental to sustainability and it supports inclusion and participation of stakeholders.

Based on the findings of this study, the most recent mosque expansion projects were undertaken based on a single view of what the Grand Mosque in Mecca should be. The single view is blind to historic traditional architecture and urban spatial organisation of the ancient city of Mecca. The most recent renovations embrace architectural concepts and materials from the wider globe. The renovation projects were designed with inputs of foreign hands and the purpose is to make it the most beautiful and largest mosque. In realising this objective Mecca and its surroundings have lost their distinct traditional features and forms. Quran clearly calls Mecca as balad (town) and also Ummul Qura (mother of all cities). This means all its landscapes are sacred just as its mosque sacred and both the city and the mosque should be given balanced consideration and attention. In other words, most of the recent renovations and redevelopment projects in and around Mecca have narrowed and fragmented their view of Mecca’s multiplicity. Hence, it is crucial to accept Angawi’s notion on the need for Hajjiology – a balanced view of Mecca It is crucial for scholars to form study groups on Hajjiology and this can probably narrow the gaps between Saudi Government and the critics of its approach to expansion and transformation of Hajj landscapes.

More than any time in the history, technological development has made Mecca more open and accessible to people from virtually all nooks and crannies around the world.
This development has added to the deepening of the processes of globalisation and its effect on the city of Mecca, its people and pilgrims’ experiences. Nevertheless, the challenges cannot be confined to the Saudi authorities, it is estimated that in 2012 alone up to 12 million pilgrims visited Mecca.\textsuperscript{48} This number is huge and it poses a challenge to pilgrims’ lifestyles in a sacred city. It is estimated that during the Hajj period alone pilgrims generate up to six million kilograms of solid waste.\textsuperscript{49} This number is outrageous for a small and sacred city like Mecca and part of the reasons for this is the proliferation of global brand of fast foods industry that sell foods in disposable items. Certainly, not all pilgrims have sufficient awareness of the implications of their consumption patterns on the city. The existing methods of waste management which include pipe transportation of waste, incineration and landfill could be harmful to the precarious ecosystem and groundwater of the sacred city. As such, it is crucial for Muslim scholars and authorities to come up with fatwas on solid waste, toilet use and doing anything to cause harm to Mecca’s environment by items of deep globalisation.

It is obvious that new and iconic structures are concentrated around the Grand Mosque. Mecca is being transformed into a city that reflects state of the art architecture and facilities from around the world. Similarly, the dominance of these types of food landscapes suggest that pilgrims’ chances to consume local foods is rather slim. Nevertheless, in spite of this, many areas adjacent to the Grand Mosque are left unplanned and unintegrated and lack access to proper infrastructure and services. This study recommends that a holistic approach is needed for transforming Mecca into an exemplary green, equitable, salubrious, and inclusive city. There is no doubt that globalisation is a forceful driver of change in cities across the world, however, a blind loan of ideas from other places could in the long term be detrimental to sustainability of Mecca. Mecca is naturally a fragile city with fragile ecosystems. However, this fragility has been addressed through divine ordinances that ban pilgrims from mishandling Mecca’s ecosystem through any act of omission or commission. Unfortunately, the deepening of globalisation has brought about new forms of challenges to the city. It is recommended that all stakeholders in redevelopment of sacred sites should go back to the drawing board to gain more insights into the historical, inclusive and sacred dimensions of sustainability of Mecca city.


Table 1: Spatial arrangements of sacred sites in Mecca and functions that outline activities directly relate to sustainability constraints and opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>Associated Symbols/Sites</th>
<th>Main Types of Land Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mawaqit</td>
<td>Mawaqit mosques</td>
<td>Agro-pastoralism, mosques, residences, security posts etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makkah Haram and its periphery</td>
<td>Haram markers, Hira cave, the birth place of Prophet Muhammad (s), Arafat, Mina, Muzdalifa</td>
<td>Sacred and spiritual activities (especially during Hajj and Umrah), Economic (hotels, shops, restaurants, banks, transport and communications, agropastoralism); Social (hospitals, schools, libraries, police stations, fire service, public toilets, cemeteries); Administrative (offices, public institutions like post offices); Spiritual (mosques); derived land uses (desert camping/racing and other recreational)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masjidil Haram</td>
<td>Maqam Ibrahim, Safa and Marwa, Zamzam cellar</td>
<td>Sacred and spiritual activities (especially during Hajj and Umrah)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ka’abah</td>
<td>Hajral Aswad, Ruknul Yamani, Multazam, Hijri Ismail</td>
<td>Sacred and spiritual activities (especially during Hajj and Umrah)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bibliography


---

50 Extracted from Barau, “Sharia land use sustainability model,” in Book of Proceedings of Conference on Technology and Sustainability in the Built Environment (Volume 4) (Riyadh: College of Architecture and Planning, King Saud University, 2010).


163


